BOOK REVIEWS

THE CHARTERED TEACHER

Gordon Kirk, Walter Beveridge & Iain Smith (2003) Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press. ISBN 1 903765 32 3 (pp. 88, £11.95, pb.)

Review by LEILA HOLM

This book is part of the series on *Policy and Practice in Education* which aims to illuminate the public and professional discussion of education from a Scottish perspective. It is a timely publication as the Chartered Teacher Programme (CTP) gains momentum and the first group of teachers successfully achieve Chartered Teacher status in June 2004. This clearly structured and lucidly written book will be of interest to all those involved in the CTP, including participants, members of partnerships which provide the Programme, school managers and Continuing Professional Development (CPD) Coordinators at school and local authority level.

The genesis of the Standard for Chartered Teacher (SCT) is described in the first chapter. The authors trace the establishment of the Standard, through from the Sutherland Report (1997) on Teacher Education Training to the report of the McCrone Committee, *A Teaching Professional for the 21st Century* (2000) and the resulting McCrone agreement. Highlighted is the key contribution of the Sutherland Report which insisted that all CPD activities should be accredited within a national framework of awards. The Report called for specific pathways of professional development within which particular levels of professional achievement could be marked. The Scottish Executive Education Department's response to the Sutherland Report is charted, culminating in the launch of the Chartered Teacher (CT) project in 2000.

Having been heavily involved in the CT project, the authors provide interesting insights into the consultation process that accompanied the defining of the SCT and the development of the CT Programme. The process involved gathering the views of thousands of teachers, educational organizations and focus group meetings, a study of current theories of effective teaching and professionalism and of approaches to CPD in teaching and other professions, of research in these fields and of attempts in other countries to describe the qualities of accomplished teachers and the establishment of professional standards. What emerged was that teachers wanted an award which was properly accredited and led to a recognized academic award (a Master's Degree) as well as the professional status of Chartered Teacher. This has inevitably meant the involvement of the Higher Education institutions as providers of the Programme, although not exclusively so, as private organizations are also involved.

The merit of the book is that it is much more than just a dry account of the establishment of the Standard and the development of the CT Programme. The authors elucidate the underlying philosophy and principles upon which the SCT is founded and defend the Standard as giving due weight to the concept of the reflective practitioner and the notion of the extended professional. They provide a rigorous critical commentary on the robustness of the Standard, which they claim is in many ways a celebration of extended professionalism rather than offering a reductionist set of competences. When analysing the interrelationship between the four components of the SCT, they demonstrate that the various capabilities and capacities that make up the Standard are derived from the belief that teaching is not reducible to a narrow set of skills, techniques and knowledge. They show how the SCT represents a much

more advanced level of professional accomplishment than the Standard for Initial Teacher Education and the Standard for Full Registration.

A separate chapter deals with the structure of the CT Programme which is designed to offer flexibility and accessibility. Assessment procedures are clarified along with the process of the accreditation of prior learning. Also included is an account of the piloting of core and option modules and the subsequent evaluation of the process. In the concluding chapters the authors highlight the positive features of the CT project which include the extensiveness of and creative approach to the consultation process, the openness of the management of the project, and the partnerships which were fostered.

The authors do not shy away from identifying the shortcomings of the CT Programme and its implementation, such as the provision of information, the costs of the modules, and support for teachers. They conclude by detailing a number of unresolved issues. Some of these are now past history, such as the readiness of the providers to accommodate the demand for Module 1. Other issues remain to be addressed such as the transferability of credits gained as part of the CT Programme to programmes leading to awards in leadership and management, and vice versa. They highlight the need for as much support as possible from authorities and schools. It would indeed be helpful if this matter were to be addressed at national level and steps taken to moderate inequalities.

I would recommend this book as a core text for those undertaking the CT Programme. It should be particularly useful when undertaking module 1 (the core compulsory module), with its focus on critical self reflection, professional development and exploration of what defines professionalism in the educational context. Teachers and managers should dip into this book to gain a better understanding of the ways in which participation in the Programme can enrich the professional lives of teachers and enhance the quality of learning and teaching.

MAKING SENSE OF EDUCATION

David Carr (2003) London: Routledge Falmer. ISBN 0 415 23074 8 (pp. 294 plus xiii, £19.99, pb.)

Review by JOHN DAKERS

David Carr is Professor of Philosophy of Education in the Faculty of Education at the University of Edinburgh. Other books include 'Educating the Virtues' (Routledge 1991) and 'Professionalism and Ethical Issues in Teaching' (Routledge 2000), the latter of which was subject to a review article in SER 34:1 May 2002.

'Making Sense of Education' is, according to the author, an attempt to introduce a much needed and updated introduction to the philosophy of education. Moreover, he claims that it should take account of recent developments in the field and should benefit those professionally involved in the process of education.

The fifteen chapters make up three sections which consider 'Education, Teaching and Professional Practice', 'Education, Knowledge and the Curriculum', and 'Schooling, Society and Culture'. The chapters stand by themselves although reading the whole book allows the reader to conceptualise their own view of education.

The first section starts by analysing "education as a matter of the acquisition of human characteristics of more than merely instrumental or utilitarian value" (p. *x*). Indeed, this is an argument that can be heard echoing up and down the

corridors of various Initial Teacher Education Institutions. Carr settles this recurring instrumentalist / non-instrumentalist debate by differentiating between the concept of education and schooling. He goes on to explore the confusions which exist between education and training; extrinsic and intrinsic forms of knowledge; academic and vocational; theory and practice; the teacher as a professional or a technician.

It is in this early examination of these concepts that Carr begins to challenge the reader to think more deeply about their own implicit theories concerning the concept of education and "[t]he complex character of teaching" which is a consequential result.

The second section takes a much more philosophical turn with discussions ranging from Descartes' dualism, to epistemology. Significantly, whilst educationalists such as Piaget and Bruner and even Skinner are given some consideration, Vygotsky is somewhat noticeable by his absence. Issues relating to the curriculum provide a comprehensive set of arguments, which encourage a more introspective consideration of issues on the part of the reader.

Finally, Carr takes the reader, or perhaps more appropriately the teacher, on a journey of self discovery. Issues relating to the politics of education are discussed, and once more, implicit theories are challenged.

Essentially the target audience are Education Studies undergraduates, but it will also be an invaluable resource to any student new to the study of education through other disciplines. Despite this target audience, postgraduate students or academics will find this book beneficial, especially if they wish to gain an updated overview of the various philosophical aspects of education. This is a challenging book requiring the reader to engage with issues at a much higher level than they may otherwise have done in the past. In so doing, however, a more informed teacher will emerge having a deeper understanding of the educational process. Ultimately this book is quite unique and is a worthy addition to any university bookshelf. It should be a key text for Initial Teacher Education.

EDUCATION, SOCIAL JUSTICE AND INTER-AGENCY WORKING: JOINED UP OR FRACTURED POLICY?

Review by JILL DUFFIELD

The title of this collection of papers sets out a theme which has become important in social policy among governments and in the research community: it subjects the connections between its elements, education, social justice and inter-agency working, to critical scrutiny. The role of education in policy discourse is examined to question whether education operates as the 'cure' for social inequality, or, alternatively, whether progress in social justice is a necessary condition for improved educational outcomes. The starting point of critique is Britain under New Labour, with a particular focus on Scotland, but the argument is deepened by a wide range of international comparison. Instances of policy and practice, from France and other European countries, Australia, the United States of America and Japan, include early years education and care, community schooling and full-service schooling in priority zones.

What is social justice in education? Is it to be discerned in terms of attainment,

or does it depend upon social and economic conditions? Inequality in Britain increased sharply in the 1980s, due to the tax and benefit policies of the Thatcher government. While the rate of widening inequality has slowed under the Labour government since 1997, the trend has continued, in spite of redistributive tax credits in favour of the poorest, and an espoused goal of eliminating child poverty (Paxton and Dixon, 2004). A growing percentage of national wealth is owned by the richest one per cent; while in 2001 Britain was no better than eleventh out of fifteen EU countries in proportions of children in poverty (improved from fifteenth position in 1997) (*ibid*. p.60).

As the editors of the present book argue, as early as 1994 in a 'blueprint for New Labour', the party favoured an 'Investors' Britain' of expanded opportunity over a 'Levellers' Britain' pursuing equality of outcome. Alongside the growth of economic inequality, the relevance of socio-economic context to education lost ground in the 1980s-90s to the notion of context-free school effectiveness. Meanwhile, Conservative application of 'new managerialism' to welfare services was also taken forward into a Labour agenda for welfare service reform expressed in performance targets. It is this reform agenda rather than economic redistribution which is officially assumed to be synonymous with the pursuit of social justice (Riddell and Tett, Chapter 1).

The desirability of 'inter-agency working' has become established internationally as a fruitful approach to a range of social problems associated with urban poverty, and tends to be traced to the notion of the 'full-service school' in the United States of America, addressed here by Boyd and Crowson in Chapter 4. However, the nature and depth of joined-up working between agencies may vary markedly in different contexts. Its success is by no means guaranteed, as social services in many societies have grown into bureaucracies with their own organisational sub-cultures. The complexity of problems of housing, health, unemployment, crime, addictions, social stigma and educational failure faced by the poor in rich societies cannot be tackled singly and may be exacerbated by a confusing plethora of service professional attentions reminiscent of the gang's plea to Officer Krupke in Bernstein's *West Side Story*. The report *For Scotland's Children* (Scottish Executive, 2001) powerfully made the case for integrated children's services. Nevertheless, concentration on organisational change may divert attention from the children and parents who are to be the beneficiaries.

Problems in achieving social justice in education through inter-agency approaches are revealed in several contributions. Far from simplifying individuals' or staff members' experiences of welfare services, Gwynedd Lloyd and colleagues (Chapter 11) find that at this, perhaps transitional, stage, complexity and confusion may be greatly increased, with different management structures, overlapping and even conflicting set of priorities and targets operating simultaneously. Parts of the book, including Smyth's comparison of early childhood provision across six EU countries (Chapter 13), highlight the dilemma of choosing between universal programmes and those targeted at the disadvantaged. Universal provision tends to reproduce and even intensify the existing patterns of social division. Services where take-up is high but not universal tend to exclude the poorest. Specific action for areas of deprivation carries the danger of stigma and deepening isolation. Exclusive focus on economic need may deny inclusion to young people with disabilities and learning difficulties (Tisdall, Chapter 12; Lightfoot, *et al*., Chapter 9; Riddell and Wilson, Chapter 16). Developing understanding of collaborative relationships between professionals needs to progress alongside new opportunities for the voices of children and parents to be heard (Mordaunt, Chapter 8; Kasama and Tett, Chapter 14).

Most contributors accept the *bona fides* of their governments in relation to commitment to social justice, although as Clarke, *et al.,* point out, it can be a 'motherhood and apple pie' agenda that must question:

whether some of the structural features of the society within which disadvantaged citizens are being so vigorously *in*cluded are not precisely the ones that are generating their *ex*clusion (p.169).

A combative stance is also taken by Baron (Chapter 6) who deconstructs the rhetoric of New Community Schools in Scotland to argue that the underlying policy intention is to increase central control of services and their clients. England's Education Action Zones (Power, Chapter 2; Hatcher and LeBlond, Chapter 3) advertise their achievements on their website largely in terms of rising attainment, and have disappeared off the electoral campaign radar in favour of the rhetoric of 'choice'. In France, the longer-established *Zones d'Education Prioritaire* struggle with ethnic and communal tensions, housing issues and a tradition of central direction that sits uneasily with moves towards local empowerment.

The book evidently suffered from publishers' perceptions of commercial realities for work originating in Scotland, and appeared only as an expensive hardback, even though the editors were at pains not to direct it specifically at Scottish readers. While Scottish developments are fully and rightly addressed, the title and presentation, and even more importantly the contents and arrangement of the collection, locate the social justice agenda in a global context. The problems of education for disadvantaged people in unequal societies, and the development of responsive, community-focused services which assist people to participate fully, require continued, persistent attention among researchers such as the authors represented here.

REFERENCES

Paxton, W. and Dixon, M. (2004) *The State of the Nation: An Audit of Injustice in the UK*. London: Institute for Public Policy Research (60)
Scottish Executive (2001) *For Scotland's Children: Better integrated children's services*. Edinburgh: HMSO.

GAELIC MEDIUM EDUCATION

Margaret Nicolson & Matthew MacIver (eds) (2003). Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press. ISBN 1 903765 34 X. (pp. 80, £11.95, pb.)

Review by MICHEL BYRNE

> *"Ceud blianna sa sgoil*
> *is sinn nar Gaidheil fhathast!"*

"A hundred years in school / and we're Gaels still!" noted scholar-poet Ruaraidh MacThòmais (Derick Thomson) with wry wonder in 1972, and there is little doubt that since the 1872 Education Act the effects of state education on the cultural confidence of the Gaels and on the fortunes of their language have been baleful. It is ironic but satisfying to consider that now, thirty years after Thomson's words, the role of state education as a potential *saviour* of the language is not only widely acknowledged but in danger of being overstated. This splendid little book, however, showcases Gaelic-medium education (GME) not primarily as a tool of language revival but as a bold, and in some ways bravely *ad hoc*, adventure in additive bilingualism from which Scottish education and Scottish society as a whole can only benefit.

Now is a good time to be casting an eye on the GME phenomenon, when it has been in place just long enough to be properly evaluated, when the Scottish Parliament has also been in place long enough to be challenged on its record as regards Gaelic and GME, and when (with a Gaelic Language Bill in the pipeline and a Gaelic Board in its infancy) only serious political commitment can ensure the long-term success of the initiative.

This tenth volume in the 'Policy and Practice' series opens with an admirably clear, concise historical overview of the place of Gaelic in Scottish education since 1872, covering the development of bilingual education from the tentative Inverness initiative of the 1960s to the innovative Western Isles' Bilingual Project of the 1970s and on to the growth of GME in Lowlands and Highlands from the mid-1980s. Remarking on the apparent 'plateau' reached in the early 2000s due to staff shortages, lack of resources and lack of Secondary follow-up to Primary GME — in spite of the thumbs-up given by the SOED-commissioned Johnstone report — MacLeod highlights the need for active promotion and proper strategic planning of GME, and the difficulties he outlines are echoed by all the book's contributors.

An insistent note in the book is that GME is not merely of importance to Gaelic speakers but has far-reaching implications for language teaching and bilingualism in Scotland generally, and it is appropriate that the second chapter directs our attention to the international context. In a typically rigorous and clear-sighted analysis Edinburgh University scholar Wilson MacLeod presents the Basque, Welsh and Irish situations, pointing out points of convergence and divergence. Although the differences can seem too great to offer valid models for GME in Scotland (e.g. number of speakers, literacy rates, status as 'national' symbol, central government attitudes), the comparisons are illuminating. It is reassuring, for example, to discover that the problem of teachers with less-than-full proficiency in the language they teach in is one already confronted and addressed by the Basques and the Irish, and it is useful to be told that Basque teacher-training efforts have concentrated more on in-service than on initial formation.

In Chapter 3, perspectives from the 'chalk-face' are given an airing by GME practitioner, now Quality Improvement Officer, Rosemary Ward. This chapter covers the challenges faced by school managements (including that of the language barrier and issues of inclusion and integration), the methodological challenges faced by teachers, problems of staff recruitment, and the role of parents. It would have been interesting to get some indication of how serious the shortage of teaching materials is – how much is available, say, in the Sciences or in the wider Environmental Studies? Is there a native reading scheme, or are teachers still having to use a scheme predicated on English-language literacy stages? What centralised resources or resource databases exist at present for GME teachers? What level and manner of inservice training is available? Ward's plea for GME to be de-marginalised may initially consist of platitudes, but she develops the argument well and is surely right in stressing the importance of an inclusive, bilingual ethos in schools which contain a GME stream; her illustration of good practice in action is particularly helpful.

While most contributors acknowledge the important role played by grassroots campaigning groups such as the CNP parent associations or the nursery schools association CNSA, Chapter 4 by Quality Improvement Officer Jean Nisbet stresses the role of local government in the growth of GME, and especially the crucial 'unblocking' role played by the introduction of Gaelic Specific Grants in 1986. Tensions between GME activists and some local authorities are alluded to but wisely not dwelt on, and resistance to GME is explained in generously rational terms rather than by reference to anti-Gaelic prejudice or centralist fear of a grassroots challenge. Nisbet clearly outlines the prominent issues from the local authority perspective: the lack of specific educational research which might have helped validate the experiment in the eyes of suspicious education authorities (and given confidence and support

to parents and teachers); staffing shortages; Scottish Government prioritising; and future prospects under the aegis of the new Bòrd na Gàidhlig.

The blockage in the full acceptance of GME in Scotland hinted at by Nisbet is squarely addressed in a final chapter by Margaret Nicolson, Senior Lecturer with the OU, and GTC Chief Executive Matt MacIver, which very effectively gatefolds Wilson MacLeod's contribution. Why has the broadly successful GME experiment not been welcomed with open arms and indeed vaunted as one of the brightest fledglings in Scotland's educational nest rather than being merely tolerated, if not resented as a dangerous cuckoo? The authors perceptively survey the restrictive linguistic, educational and political contexts within which GME has struggled to survive and flourish, and soberly reflect on the country's 'rather awkward relationship with language', but they end on a note of cautious optimism.

Inevitably, the volume has been overtaken by events. GME is now part of the Education and Young People ministerial portfolio, as recommended by several contributors, and the lack of activity in the Secondary sector highlighted in the book has begun to be addressed in Glasgow with the planned opening of a GME Secondary School in 2005. On a less positive note, the perversely qualified reaction of the EIS to the latter development confirms the book's critique of the educational establishment in Scotland. This is a highly relevant and challenging addition to the 'Policy and Practice' series, and both the editors and the contributors are to be congratulated on this quality.

There are very few typos, and I only wish to draw attention to those which caused me momentary confusion: on p.33, Table 4, the second last and third last entries should refer to secondary pupils, not primary; and on p.62 the table presumably refers to Higher presentations not Standard Grade.

THE MOTIVATED SCHOOL

Alan McLean (2003) London: Paul Chapman Publishing. ISBN: 0 7619 4385 4 (pp. 144, £16.99, pb.)

Reviewed by BRIAN BOYD

The Motivated School is an important book. It addresses a number of key issues which are central to Scottish educational policy, including Better Behaviour; Better Learning, Inclusion and Raising Attainment. It is also a controversial book, challenging as it does "woolly thinking" on issues such as self-esteem, rewards and motivation to learn. For many teachers, however, it will be a disappointing book, since its A4 format, its title (the latest in a series which has seen "The Intelligent School", "The Learning School" and "The Empowered School") and, not least the reputation of its author as someone who produced "Promoting Positive behaviour", may lead them to expect a book which is practical in its orientation. Instead, it is a highly academic treatise, complex and at times self-absorbed.

This is a book which majors in conceptual frameworks. The reader has to work hard to hang onto the four "drivers", operating along two dimensions, with four types of learning context, each of which acts along a continuum which has four "gears"- and all this before we reach the two central dilemmas. The book is full of complex figures and diagrams, culminating on page 20 with one entitled "16 classroom types". Any model with this degree of complexity is unlikely to have any immediate practical impact.

However, it would be wrong to dismiss the book on these grounds. It is an important contribution to the debate about effective schools and how they meet the needs of all of their pupils. It addresses the most complex problems of our time, including the causes of disaffection, the strategies schools use to help these young people to achieve their potential, the effects schools actually have on pupils' self-esteem and the desirability of intrinsic rather than extrinsic rewards. Alan is characteristically robust in his thesis that self-efficacy rather than woolly concepts of self-esteem is what schools should be trying to foster in young people.

To be fair to the author, the book does not aim to be a "quick fix" but rather to distil the huge body of research in this area so that its impact on schools might be explored. It seeks to illuminate the issues and to challenge policy-makers, school managers and teachers to engage with them. There are many important ideas such as "engagement", the role of "ability" in learning and explanations of why there is a gender imbalance in terms of attainment nationally, which Alan touches on but does not fully develop. Indeed, it is not until chapter 12 that he fully addresses the issues implicit in the title of the book

It is this tantalising look at issues which leads me to believe that this book must not be an end of the matter. Alan McLean has been making an important contribution to education in Scotland for nearly three decades now in the role of psychologist, staff developer and thinker. Perhaps he needs to take a leaf out of the book of another influential educational thinker, Michael Fullan, and write *The Motivated School: the Sequel*. In such a book he could combine the practicality of *Promoting Positive Behaviour* with this theoretical book, and write a manual of some kind which helps school managers, teachers and other stakeholders to put into practice the ideas he has developed. *The Motivated School: from theory to practice* might be a less self-indulgent title than Fullan's but it would almost certainly have more impact on practice in Scottish schools.

Go for it, Alan. There's an eager readership out there.