Histories of Scottish teacher education: sources for research

Moira Hulme,
University of Glasgow

ABSTRACT
This article considers sources available to researchers interested in exploring the development of teacher education as a professional field and teacher education research as an educational science. The position of the history of education as a university subject has itself been subject to contestation (producing expansion and contraction) and illustrates aptly the precarious and contingent nature of claims to jurisdiction in specialist professional fields (Robinson, 2000). This article considers the challenge made by historians and sociologists working in a cultural mode to ‘standard’ narrative histories (Novoa, 2001; Popkewitz et al, 2001) and identifies sources for research that might be deployed in constructing a ‘genealogy’ of teacher education (Gale, 2001). The purpose of this article is not to offer an account from among the multiple histories of teacher education but to draw attention to the range of source material and value of retaining an historical perspective within interdisciplinary enquiry.

INTRODUCTION
The relationship between teacher education and the universities of Scotland has a long and complex history. The place of teacher education in universities and the influence of research on modes of teacher education are subject to continuing and undiminished debate. Debates about the scholarly demands of teacher education are inextricably linked with claims to professional status, specialist expertise and the project of building national culture and identity (as argued by Humes and Paterson 1983 and, beyond Scotland, by Green, 1990). In current times, teacher education policy is again under active development (Donaldson, 2011). This paper signposts sources of evidence for researchers interested in exploring the dynamic relation between the academy and teachers’ professional knowledge and practice.

The paper opens by considering the potential and significance of an historical perspective in debates on teacher education. The main body of the paper is structured in four sections. The first two sections consider sources of evidence with regard to: (1) Education and the Scottish universities; and (1) teacher education institutions and demonstration schools. Moving from an institutional frame, the paper then considers (3) other published primary and secondary sources relevant to the field, including research publications and policy documents. Finally consideration is afforded to (4) the potential of non-text-based material including visual, spatial and aural evidence.
WHY AN HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE MATTERS

Much has been made of the Scottish ‘educational tradition’ (Paterson, 2009). Critiques have been offered of ‘standard’ narrative histories (‘Acts and facts’) that are based on an assumption of progress1. Drawing on Williams (1977: 115), ‘tradition’ offers an ‘intentionally selective version of a shaping past and pre-shaped present’. Humes and Paterson (1983:1-2) have argued that early histories of Scottish education tended to be ‘narrative in form, broadly nationalistic in tone’ and urged critical engagement to consider ‘the cultural functions they serve and the sort of understandings they permit’. McDermid (1997:99) has offered a persuasive critique of the ‘masculine myth of the democratic intellect’ and has challenged ‘gender blind’ constructions of the history of the Scottish teaching profession. Silver (1981:293) reminds us that, ‘historical selection is not random, and is conducted within the terms of the historian's understandings of social, economic, political, cultural or other processes differently defined’. Archives are silent. The researcher attaches meaning and gives voice to their selection of history’s actors.

Productive interdisciplinary alliances between sociology and history have been forged through application of the genealogical approach of Foucault (1972) and the reflexive sociology of Bourdieu (Bourdieu, 1991; Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992). Popkewitz et al (2001: ix) describe the commitment of cultural historians to conjoin the cultural and the social in the integration of ‘French traditions of the history of science and genealogical studies…and critical traditions concerned with knowledge, power and social change’. In sketching shifts within academic history, Popkewitz et al (2001:6-12) consider how intellectual ideas and practices achieve value – or symbolic capital – through discursive struggles for legitimation at particular junctures. Certain forms of historical narration achieve prominence and work to exclude or continue earlier forms by other means2.

Teacher education as an area of public policy is not restricted to a history of ideas or a de-contextualised intellectual field. Policy genealogy traces the movement of ideas and practices from their origins to new purposes. It takes as its specific focus the particulars of temporary policy settlements, that is, policy ‘realisations’ (Foucault, 1972:207). Gale (2001:390) identifies three questions central to the task of policy genealogy: (1) how policies change over time; (1) how the apparent rationality and consensus of policy production might be problematised; and, (3) how temporary alliances are formed and reformed around conflicting interests in the policy production process. Gale (2001) maintains that whilst broad narratives of policy are advanced through ‘archaeology’, complex negotiation strategies involving ‘local’ specific knowledges are contained in its ‘genealogy’. Policy genealogy represents

---


2 For example, in the late nineteenth century and first decades of the twentieth century political history was subject to increasing challenge by the ascendency of social history, which was itself subject to contestation by the ‘new social history’ of the 1960s (see Simon (1983) and Cohen (1999) for Education). The period of the 1970s and 80s saw the development of ‘revisionist’ histories characterised as the ‘knowledge wars’ (See Hayden White’s (1973) Metahistory). The legitimacy of this discursive theme was attacked for a neglect of agency or recognition of the contradictory tendencies of public schooling, in anticipation of the ‘cultural wars’ initiated in the late 1990s and early 2000s (See Roger Chartier’s (1997) On the Edge of the Cliff).
a commitment to the formation of a ‘history of the present’ within which historical inquiry is used to de-familiarise the past (Dean, 1994).

The value of an historical approach lies in insights provided through identification of continuity and discontinuity, ‘solidarities and antagonisms’ (Chartier, 1997:4) (a process described by Williams (1977:121) as ‘internally comparative differentiation’). The composition of policy communities changes over time and the relative influence of the various micro-communities shift (Marker, 1994). Whilst much attention has focused on the potential for policy learning through cross-national comparison, fewer policy resources have been deployed in identifying lessons that might be drawn from the fissures and ruptures of the domestic past. Historical explorations may identify ‘broken links’ in the development of Scottish education and teacher education (Smith, 1913; Stocks, 1986), and help to account for the apparent paradox in the nation’s historic commitment to scholarly teachers and the relatively recent full involvement of its universities in initial teacher education. Despite a rhetorical commitment to policy ‘learning’ in contemporary policy discourse, practice has been inconsistent. There is much that might be learned from excavation of the lessons from research that policy makers have chosen to learn or to disregard at particular historical junctures, and the ways in which ‘path dependency’ influences choices (Dwyer and Ellison, 2009). These are not uncommon challenges and are not specific to the UK or to education policy.

Historical exploration of the place and influence of research on policy and practice in teacher education in Scotland is illuminated not only by ‘Acts and facts’ but by accounts of the struggles for professional status and autonomy of school teachers, at times aided and at times thwarted by interrelated struggles in the development of the academic fields of teacher education and educational research (Furlong and Lawn, 2011). This attention to ‘peopling policy’ (Ball, 1997:270) and to processes of contestation, acknowledges the value of policy ‘sociology’ (McPherson and Raab, 1988; Ozga, 1987), ‘scholarship’ (Grace, 1995, 1998) or ‘genealogy’ (Gale, 2001) in teacher education at a time of active development and transition. Attention to action and experience is important as policy communities seek to re-calibrate teacher education for the twenty-first century.

**SOURCE MATERIAL: RECORDS AND ARTIFACTS**

Examining the relationship between teacher education policy and practices and educational research is inevitably a complex task crossing many boundaries. As a field of public policy, teacher education is political. As a contribution to the ‘public good’ it is moral field of activity. Teacher education research brings methodological and philosophical perspectives, imbued with contemporary debates on the politics of ‘evidence’. The sources of evidence that contribute to an exploration of the complex relationship between teacher education, policy and research are therefore varied, multifaceted and extensive in scope. They are written in different ‘codes’ from a variety of standpoints for a range of purposes, with a view from particular points in time.

**The Scottish Universities**

The Scottish universities are themselves custodians of rich archive material on the history of teacher education, including biographies and personal collections of
key figures such as: Sir Henry Wood, Jordanhill College of Education (Strathclyde University archives); William Boyd and Sir John Adams at the University of Glasgow; George Baird, Simon Laurie, Godfrey Thomson and Alexander Darroch at Edinburgh University; William McClelland at Dundee and James Scotland at Aberdeen (re. Aberdeen Training College). Archives have supported the generation of new analyses and focused collections such as that generated by the ESRC research project, *A Scottish School of Educational Research, 1925-1950* (Deary et al, 2010). The development of digital archives further extends opportunities for policy genealogy.  

In constructing a genealogy of teacher education, the history of the creation of chairs of education is a rich resource. Scotland is renowned for the creation of the first university chairs of Education in the UK. First advanced by Professor James Pillans at Edinburgh University in 1834, the first chairs of Education were financed in 1876 by endowments from the Bell bequest, supplemented by the precarious (and short lived) award of a government grant. The first professors of Education in Scotland were J.M.D. Meiklejohn at St Andrews and Simon Laurie (previously an Assistant to Pillans) at Edinburgh. The case for chairs in Education, and opposition to their foundation, are recorded in publications by key figures in the education community. These include: David Ross, Principal of the Church of Scotland Training College Glasgow, *Education as a University Subject: Its History, Present Position and Prospects* (1883); Simon Laurie (1882) *The Training of Teachers*; and William Jolly, HM Inspector of schools, *Professional Training of Teachers* (1873) (reported by Glasgow, 1875). The work of Robertson (1990), ‘Between the Devil and the Deep Sea’: Ambiguities in the Development of Professorships of Education, 1899 to 1932, provides an interesting comparative account of the uneasy location of education in universities in England and Wales and the constraints on the influence of professors of Education in the practice field. Records of faculty appointments are one source of evidence that signals the establishment of Education within the academy. The emerging influence of educationists (and displacement of non-education faculty) can be traced through membership of committees influencing education policy.

The contested place of Education as a university subject forms part of broader struggles in the professionalisation of teaching. These include the admission of women students to Scottish universities (from the 1890s), the place of professional programmes for the ‘lower professions’ in ancient universities, (unequal) access to bursary support for university courses, and responses to the perceived threat of Anglicization associated with public elementary education following the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act which ensured the later feminization (in numbers) of the

---

3 Researchers may find the UK Archival Thesaurus (UKAT) useful in identifying index terms commonly used by archive repositories (http://www.ukat.org.uk/).

4 The bequest of Andrew Bell, founder of the Madras or monitory system. The Bell bequest had served to support the establishment of elementary schools in Scotland, a need that was overtaken by the 1872 Act, allowing the universities to lobby for a redirection of funds towards the establishment of university chairs (Bell, 1990).

5 Despite much difficulty is establishing the role of the Chair in Education in relation to teacher education at Edinburgh, Laurie exerted considerable influence on the establishment of day colleges for teacher training in England. For further information on the influence of a ‘Scottish diaspora’ on schools and universities in England in the twentieth century, see Lowe (2003).

6 The first English Chair of Education was established at Newcastle in 1895 (Crook, 2002).
teaching workforce in Scotland (Corr, 1997; McDermid, 1997). The multiple stories of teachers’ education are influenced and connected by national identity, gender\textsuperscript{7}, social class, religion, language and geography.

**Colleges of Education and Demonstration Schools**

Institutional histories have been authored to mark the merger of colleges of education with universities in the 1990s. See for example Harrison and Marker’s (1996) history of Jordanhill College, Fitzpatrick’s (1995) history of Scottish Catholic teacher education, *No Mean Service*\textsuperscript{8}, and Kirk’s (2002) *Moray House and the Road to Merger*. These ‘insider accounts’ both enhance and in some ways limit the evidence base available in re-constructing an account of the historical development of teacher education. The Gateway of Archives to Scottish Higher Education (GASHE) provides electronic access to descriptions of archive records relating to ten higher education institutions\textsuperscript{9} in Scotland, including corporate and personal biographies. Supplementary material may be located through searches of the National Archives of Scotland (NAS) (http://www.nas.gov.uk/), the Scottish Archives Network (SCAN) (http://www.scan.org.uk/), the National Library of Scotland (http://www.nls.uk/) and the Scottish Government Library, Edinburgh. Documentation relating to training institutions and demonstration schools can also be traced through city council archives\textsuperscript{10}.

\textsuperscript{7} Women were denied the right to graduate from Scottish universities until 1893 (Corr, 1997). Career structures for women teachers in Scottish co-educational schools offered fewer prospects for advancement, although by 1918 women comprised 74% of the profession (Corr, 1997). Adams (1990:92) reports that the Glasgow School Board (which had a policy of favouring graduate teachers) prohibited the promotion for women beyond the post of infants’ mistress, which was only eligible for women aged over 45 years. Married women were barred from teaching in local authority schools in Scotland between 1918 and 1945. A ‘resign on marriage’ clause, supported by the clergy, was introduced in employment contracts for women teachers in Dundee and Glasgow from 1915. In 1911 women school board teachers were paid half the mean annual salary of male board teachers. The average salaries of Catholic schoolmistresses were £7 lower than their female board counterparts and £4 lower than Catholic schoolmasters, although prospects of promotion were higher due to difficulties in recruiting male Catholic teachers (McDermid, 2009). Between 1880 and 1914 Scottish schoolmasters commanded higher salaries than their English counterparts, whereas Scottish school mistresses (higher in number than male teachers across the UK) were consistently less well paid than English women teachers, although they were more highly qualified (Corr, 1997). The 1924 *New Teacher Training Regulations* required male entrants to the profession to be graduates. Higher qualifications were used to justify pay differentials and promotion prospects and to draw gendered curricula boundaries. The Independent Labour Party and the Educational Institute of Scotland did little to advance the cause of women teachers. The Scottish Men Teachers Association challenged the case for equal pay in the 1920s (Adams, 1990). School economies in the 1930s exacerbated the disadvantaged position of women teachers.

\textsuperscript{8} The Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Glasgow archives also contain primary sources of information relating to Catholic education services (from 1870), including teacher’s certificate approvals. See also O’Hagan’s (1996) *Change, challenge and achievement: a study of the development of Catholic Education in Glasgow in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries*; the biography of Sister Mary of St Philip (Frances Mary Lescher) 1825-1904 (Sisters of Notre Dame, 1920); and *The Foundations of the Sisters of Notre Dame in England and Scotland from 1845 to 1895* (Sisters of Notre Dame, 1895).

\textsuperscript{9} The ten institutions are: University of St Andrews (founded 1413); University of Glasgow (founded 1451); University of Edinburgh (inaugurated 1583); University of Strathclyde (founded in 1964; origins as Anderson’s Institution 1796); Heriot-Watt University (origins as Edinburgh School of Arts, 1821); Glasgow School of Art (origins as Glasgow Government School of Design, 1845); Glasgow Caledonian University (founded in 1993; origins as Glasgow School of Cookery 1875; predecessor institutions the Queen’s College, Glasgow and Glasgow Polytechnic); University of Dundee (origins as University College, Dundee 1881); Edinburgh College of Art (founded 1907); Napier University (origins as Napier Technical College 1964). See http://www.gashe.ac.uk/index.html

\textsuperscript{10} The Dundee City Archives holds records relating to Dundee College of Education, including the demonstration school log book and news cuttings 1921-1974. The Mitchell Library, Glasgow, houses the City of Glasgow Archives.
Deliberation on the locus of expertise and balance of theory and practice in teacher education can be advanced though consideration of the operation of demonstration schools (1890-1930), an early forerunner of school-based models of teacher education in England and Wales (Robertson, 1995; Robinson, 2004). In contrast to England, ‘demonstration’ schools continued to exist in Scotland far beyond the early experimental period in England which ended in the early 1930s\(^\text{11}\). Issues surrounding the nature and purpose of demonstration schools (such as the balance of ‘experiment’ or exploratory enquiry compared to ‘modelling’ practice) are important in highlighting long-standing tensions between theory and practice in teacher education. The history of the ‘demonstration school’ is useful in tracing the trajectories of temporary settlements in this area. The concept of ‘hub schools’ (Donaldson, 2011) in Scotland and University Training Schools and ‘Teaching Schools’, modeled on teaching hospitals, proposed in England (Department for Education, 2010) are the latest articulation of the theory-practice nexus in professional education.

**Other published primary and secondary sources**

As previously noted, the history of Scottish education has proven fertile ground. Historians have focused attention on teachers (e.g. Hendrie’s 1997 history of the \textit{Dominie}); recruitment to teaching (Mercer and Forsyth, 1975); teacher education (Cruikshank, 1970); school administration (e.g. Roxburgh’s 1971 history of \textit{The School Board of Glasgow, 1873-1919}); school inspection (Bone, 1974); Scottish universities\(^\text{12}\) (Carter and Withrington, 1992; Anderson, 1989); research institutes and educational research (Lawn, 2004, 2008; Brett et al, 2010); and most notably the national education system (see Kerr, 1910; Morgan, 1927; Knox, 1953; Bone, 1967; Hunter, 1968; Scotland, 1969ab; Humes and Paterson, 1983; Paterson, 2003).

The national press and parliamentary papers provide supplementary sources of evidence particularly in times of controversy such as the closure (1981\(^\text{13}\)) and merger of the colleges of education (late 1990s), and problems of teacher workforce planning restricting availability of post-probation employment for new teachers (from 2007). Marker (1997:69) wryly notes that, ‘Teacher education excites little public interest except when, occasionally, it moves into the political arena.’

The scholarly work of educationists in the developing field provide insights into the application of ‘educational thought’ and early research to teacher education practice (Laurie, 1882; Currie, 1891; Darrock, 1903; Adams, 1912; Rusk, 1912, 1932). The relationship of practice to research reflects the shifts and increasing number of subdivisions emerging within academic fields relevant to practical education. Selleck (1968) provides an account of the move from ‘instrumentary education’ (1860-1890), influenced by the imposed Revised Code, to the emergence and influence of the New Education. Through a review of early manuals of method, Selleck (1968:50) shows how masters and mistresses of method commonly positioned

\(^{11}\) There is no Scottish equivalent to the legacy provided by Joseph Findlay (1908, 1911) in the two volume, \textit{The Demonstration School Record}. Findlay (1860-1940) was Professor of Education at the University of Manchester from 1902-1925 and pioneer of the Fielden Schools (1906-1926), with the educationist Catherine Dodd (1860-1932).

\(^{12}\) For a guide to further reading on individual university histories, see Anderson (2006:231-32)

\(^{13}\) In 1981 Callendar Park and Hamilton Colleges closed and Notre Dame and Craiglockhart merged to form St Andrew’s College.
teachers as ‘practical trainers’, working with the curriculum in use (requirements of the Code), rather than experimental pedagogues. The published work of Simon Laurie and Robert Rusk challenge the narrowness of this pragmatic, instrumental approach whilst maintaining an explicit practicality ethic. Teacher education curricula, textbooks and assessment practices are useful sources of information14.

Research engagement can be traced through the reports of the Scottish Education Reform Committee (SERC, 1917) formed in 1915, and through education periodicals15 such as the EIS Scottish Educational Journal (SEJ). Reports within these publications signal the contributions of key figures who worked across communities and sought to more closely integrate policy, research and practice, such as William Boyd of Glasgow University and Neil Snodgrass, Principal Lecturer in Methods at Dundee Training Centre (Brett et al, 2010). It is also evident within anniversary collections produced by education bodies such as the Centenary Handbook of the EIS (Belford, 1946); Education in Transition (Brown and Wake, 1988), which celebrates sixty years of the work of researchers at the Scottish Council for Research in Education; and A Ministry of Enthusiasm: Centenary Essays on the Workers’ Educational Association (Roberts, 2003), which considers links between adult education and the universities of Edinburgh and Glasgow (Duncan, 2003:176-97).

Areas prioritised for research and contemporary methodological debates are signaled in the Presidential addresses, records and publications of the Scottish Educational Research Association (SERA) (established in 1974); dissertation titles in Education at the Scottish universities; and in a number of surveys of educational research conducted in a period of significant expansion in the social sciences (e.g. Thouless’s 1969 Map of Educational Research; Taylor’s 1973 Research Perspectives in Education; Butcher and Pont’s three volume Educational Research in Britain 1968, 1970, 1973; and Cohen et al. 1982 Educational Research and Development in Britain, 1970-1980). Reviews of British research on the education of teachers is less well developed but includes Taylor’s (1969) chapter, ‘Recent research on the education of teachers’; and later Wragg’s (1982) A Review of Research in Teacher Education. The continuing paucity of research on and for teacher education internationally is noted in the literature review to support the Review of Teacher Education in Scotland (Menter et al, 2010).

It is important to acknowledge the contribution of John Nisbet (1999; 2005) who has done much to chart the contribution of research to education from the late nineteenth century through the twentieth century (see also Hamilton, 1985). Reflecting on the development of ‘educational studies’ in the second half of the twentieth century, Richardson (2002) identifies three trajectories: political arithmetic (1940-59); the New Sociology of Education (1960-82); and school effectiveness research (1983 onwards). The 1960s and 1970s was a significant period of growth for education studies as an academic field in the UK16. The Educational Research

---

14 See for example Fleming’s (1954) review of the problems posed by the psychology of education in examination papers on teacher training programmes, 1900-1950s.

15 For a review of education periodicals that predate the British Education Index (1954–), see Fletcher (1970) and Tropp (1958). These include: Scottish Class Teacher, 1900-17; Scottish Educational and Literary Journal, 1852-5; Scottish Instructor, 1846-7; Scottish Schoolmaster (Scottish Schoolmaster’s Association), 1935- (Tropp, 1958:162).

16 For an account of the relationship between Sociology and Teaching see Woods and Pollard (1988). For a
Board of the Social Science Research Council (SSRC) was established in 1965 (SSRC was renamed the Economic and Social Research Council in 1983). The number of journals and societies grew, reflecting the growth and health of the field (Furlong and Lawn, 2011). The Philosophy of Education Society of Great Britain was founded in 1964; the History of Education Society in 1967; the British and Scottish Educational Research Associations in 1974; and the British Comparative Education Society17 in 1979.

Research commissioned by partners within the Scottish teacher education policy community is also useful in identifying agenda for policy-oriented research at different times and includes grey literature such as reports commissioned, for example, by then Scottish Office Education Department (SOED) that remain unpublished and are located through secondary sources (see Brown 1996 for examples).

Primary sources on teacher education policy include the documentary records produced by the training institutions and regulatory bodies such as the minutes of the Provincial Committees (1905-20); National Committee for the Training of Teachers (1920-1959) (held at the National Library of Scotland); the Scottish Council for the Training of Teachers (1959-1967); the General Teaching Council (for example, the Visitation Committee records from 1967 and national guidelines for the accreditation of programmes from the mid-1980s) (Marker, 1997, pp.70-73).

In addition there are the official records produced by the Scottish Education Department and archived by the Scottish Government library. The Scottish Education Department was based in London18 until 1922. The Department (from 1885) was influenced by the firm leadership of the Permanent Secretaries Sir Henry Craik (1846-1927) and then Sir John Struthers (1857-1925), neither of whom was inclined to transfer responsibility for teacher education to universities19 (Stocks, 1986). The political context of public policy making is addressed in Craik’s (1914), The State and its Relation to Education. Significant reports in the post-war period include the Report of the Advisory Council on Education in Scotland, Training of Teachers (1946); the Scottish sections of the Robbins Report, Committee on Higher Education (1963); the Brunton Report, The Training of Graduates for Secondary Education (1972); the Sneddon Report, Learning to Teach (1978); as well as the more recent Sutherland Report, Teacher Education and Training: A Study (National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education, 1997); A Teaching Profession for the Twenty-First Century (SEED, 2001); Evolution or Revolution? (HMIE, 2003); the Review of Initial Teacher Education, Stage Two (SEED, 2005); and Teaching, Scotland’s Future (Donaldson, 2011). To these we can add the creation of records through an expansion of participative and deliberative approaches to policy formation, which

17 The British Comparative Education Society merged in 1997 with the British Association of Teachers and Researchers in Overseas Education to form the British Association for International and Comparative Education.
18 Dover House, London remained the official address until St Andrew’s House, Edinburgh was opened in 1940 (Scotland, 1972).
19 Greater involvement of universities in teacher education in England and Wales was among the recommendations of the Cross Commission (1886-1888), which led to the creation of the National Education Association (NEA). The archive of the NEA (1888-1959) is housed at the London Metropolitan Archives.
create opportunities for the inclusion of ‘mini-publics’ within formal consultation processes (Hoppe, 2010). The most prescient examples include the consultation on the reform of the school curriculum in Scotland (Baumfield et al. 2009), reviews of the standards framework (e.g. Report of the Chartered Teacher Review Group, Scottish Government 2008a), submissions to the Review of Teacher Education in Scotland (Donaldson, 2011), and the Scottish Government online public participation project, Engage for Education (http://www.engageforeducation.org/).

Official statistics on teacher supply and training can be found in the annual reports Education in Scotland, 1947-79; Scottish Annual Statistics, 1966-75; and more recently in the results of the annual teacher workforce planning exercise published through Scottish Government Education Statistics and the GTCS Employment Surveys and Statistical Digests. See also the Report of the Teacher Employment Working Group (Scottish Government, 2008b). Historical records of employment are clearly patterned by the interaction of gender, social class, religion and geography which are translated into differences in education and training, subject status, salary and promotion prospects (McDermid, 1997).

**Visual, spatial and aural evidence**

Narratives can be pictorial, graphic and literary\(^\text{20}\). Following the ‘pictorial’ or ‘figural turn’ in social sciences, images are regarded as producers of meaning, rather than reflections of reality or registers of facts. Novoa (2001: 45) views images ‘not so much as primary sources, but as forms of saying and seeing that change our historical understanding’. Advocating close reading of images and the promotion of visual literacy, Novoa positions images as polysemic and therefore problematic. Sociologists and historians working in a cultural mode are able to draw on advances in visual methods (Prosser, 1998; Van Leeuwen and Jewitt, 1998)\(^\text{21}\). The use of photographs in educational and historical research has been undertaken by Margolis (2000). Grosvenor et al (1999) have used images in their exploration of the neglected social history of the classroom.

More than a decade ago, Novoa (2000) generated an international archive of public images of teachers available in pictures, cartoons, photographs, engravings, drawings, paintings and book illustrations. Consideration was afforded to the social function of the images and the circumstances of their production. Novoa (2000:57) highlights the value of the caricature to historians’ interest in the politics of representation: ‘the caricaturist usually intends to reach a large viewing public and hence favours the understanding of relationships: the relationship of the image with the public; the relationship of the public with portrayed situations’. This project shows how close reading of visual sources can provide additional insight not readily visible in documentary sources. Novoa (2001:57) notes the constancy of public images of teachers available from the seventeenth century: ‘it is difficult to identify the ruptures constructed by the historiography of education, established chiefly through the study of texts of the educators and school reform laws’.

In addition to images, the architecture of college buildings and normal schools can provide insights into the social geography of schooling and the topography of

---

\(^{20}\) For a discussion of literary representations of teachers see Dickson (2008) and Menter (2008).

\(^{21}\) See for example Banks (2001) contribution to visual ethnography and the cultural studies perspective advanced by Rose (2001).
social relations. Vinao (2001:131) offers an account of space as a social construct, rather than a ‘setting’ or ‘container’. Space is converted into territory or ‘place’. For Vinao (2001:132), ‘Space says and communicates, therefore it educates’. The school, university faculty and teacher education institution is an academic space constructed through specialisation. Specialisation provides boundary markers that construct difference and offer some insulation from incursion from other sources of municipal or ecclesiastical authority. The physical location of University Schools of Education in relation to arts and science faculties may indicate (current and historical) relations between Education and the wider university.

In the UK the work of Catherine Burke and Ian Grosvenor is advancing the development of a sensory history of education (Burke and Grosvenor, 2007; Burke et al. 2010). Cross-disciplinary connections have been forged between educational history, cultural geography and educational architecture. Most recently, innovative work has been undertaken to explore ‘hearing, sound and aurality’ in the school, opening up new possibilities for historical pedagogic research (Burke and Grosvenor, 2011).

Attending to the sensory, seeking out past sensory regimes and engaging in intersensory analysis offers another way of knowing and, hopefully, understanding past (and present) schooling

(Burke and Grosvenor, 2011:17)

Photographs, prints and drawings of educational buildings are available in the archive collections of the Royal Commission on Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland, which holds records relating to Aberdeen, Craigie, Craiglockhart, Dunfermline College of Physical Education, Hamilton, Jordanhill, Moray House, Northern College and Notre Dame Colleges of Education. Moving image collections are available from Scotland on Screen, Scottish Screen and the National Library of Scotland and include the documentaries: Men and Women of Tomorrow (1925) showing educational opportunities in Edinburgh; The Children’s Story (1938) produced under the supervision of John Grierson for screening at the Glasgow Empire Exhibition, Bellahouston Park22; Our Schools (1948) and Our 3Rs (1961) showing classes in schools and colleges in Glasgow; Learning for Living (1956) a review of educational practice in a junior secondary school; The School Master (1963) on the daily life of a primary teacher; These Are Our Children (1964) a review of innovative teaching techniques in use in Edinburgh primary schools; and College with a Difference (1977) a film of innovation in teacher education at Dundee College of Education.

---

22 The Grierson Film Archive is housed at Stirling University Library. Grierson also produced Children at School (1937), a documentary focused on English state schools held within the British Film Institute national archive. For a critical reading of the construction of national identity and memory through the Empire Exhibition see McArthur (1986). Lorimer (1999) discusses the construction of ‘place-identities’ and the politics of representation in architecture in his review of the role of the National Trust for Scotland. He also draws on the 1938 Empire Exhibition as an example of the fabrication of heritage and collective memory.
CONCLUSION

This paper has begun to outline the rich archive resources, documentary and visual sources available to members of the educational research community interested in developments in teacher education in Scotland. Richardson (2000:24) cautions educationists to resist historical inquiries that are only intent on ‘idealising and flattering’ a professional audience. He goes on to note that the professional audience has largely ‘turned its back on the field’ (history of education) in favour of field-based, problem-focused social sciences. The dominance of technicist and practical forms of deliberation, the uncritical adoption of the ‘evidence’ message and the politicisation of pedagogy, which find support within the school effectiveness genre, give greater currency to the need for an historical perspective. Such a perspective might usefully foreground contest and challenge in the formation of responses to the problems of teacher quality and school improvement.

For Popkewitz et al (2001: xii) cultural history invites researchers to engage in ‘a conversation that interrelates historical, archival studies of education with social, cultural and political theories of knowledge’. Engagement with theory helps to interrupt the construction of ‘imagined communities’ (Anderson, 1991) in ‘standard’ narrative histories. Cultural history moves beyond ‘actor-centered’ and ‘event-oriented’ narratives and considers the role of the researcher, as inquiring subject and producer of texts, engaged in constructing temporality and ‘employment’ (Chartier, 1997). A ‘genealogy’ of teacher education might place individual perspectives within the social milieu of their production (Ozga’s 1987 contextual ‘bigger picture’) to consider persistence and rupture across the intellectual and professional field. Such an approach is exemplified in part by the sociology of educational science in the United States undertaken by Lagemann (1997, 2000). Attention to genealogy precludes a deterministic reading of policy effects and returns the analytical focus to the accomplishment of provisional policy settlements. This epistemological challenge offers new opportunities for interdisciplinary activity within the social sciences and humanities.

Acknowledgement: This article developed from the historical strand of a symposium convened by Ian Menter at the Scottish Educational Research Association annual conference (November, 2010): ‘Teacher Education in Scotland: Ripe for Research-informed Renewal?’ I am grateful to Ian Menter and Donald Christie for their helpful comments.

SOURCE MATERIAL PUBLISHED BEFORE 1950

Findlay, J. J. (Ed), (1908) Demonstration Schools Record, volume 1. Manchester University Press.
REFERENCES


